

**APPG FOR MUSIC EDUCATION 14 JULY 2020**

**Minutes**

**AGM Business**

**Parliamentarians present:** Alex Davies-Jones MP, Barbara Keeley MP, Baroness Eaton, David Lipsey MP, David Warburton MP, Baroness Nicholson, Lord Black, Earl of Clancarty, Nick Trench, Simon Baynes MP, Tim Clement-Jones MP, Wera Hobhouse MP

**Apologies:** Baroness Bonham Carter; Sharon Hodgson MP; Baroness McIntosh; Dehenna Davison MP; Kerry McCarthy MP; Baroness Altmann; Alberto Costa MP; Baroness Bonham-Carter; Greg Smith MP; Jim Shannon MP; Lord Lucas; Marion Fellows MP; Damian Green MP; Steve Brine MP; David Simmonds MP; Ian Mearns MP; David Simmonds MP; Ian Mearns MP; Robert Halfon MP; Carol Monaghan MP; Lord Watson

The attending parliamentarians were joined by members of the music education sector.

**1. Welcome** – Diana Johnson MP

**2. Election of Officers**

**Chair and Registered Contact:** Diana Johnson MP

**Co-Chair:** Lord Black

**Vice-Chairs:** Earl of Clancarty, Lord Aberdare, Sharon Hodgson MP, David Warburton MP, Alex Davies-Jones MP, Baroness Finlay, Baroness Nicholson, Baroness Bonham-Carter

All were elected to serve on the APPG.

**3. Income and expenditure statement**

The expenditure of the Group (purely staff time donated by the secretariat) will be outlined in the register of All-Party parliamentary groups.

**4. Close of AGM**

**Main Business - speeches**

Following the AGM, presentations were given by **Dr Ally Daubney and Duncan Mackrill** from the University of Sussex, **Sue Beckett**, Chief Executive Officer of Portsmouth Music Hub, **John Bergin**, Chief Executive Officer of Newham Music Hub, **Dr Jodie Underhill**, Independent Researcher and **Deborah Annetts**, Chief Executive of the Incorporated Society of Musicians. Presentations covered the state of music education in the classroom and in Music Education Hubs in light of COVID-19, followed by an overview of the ISM's recently commissioned global literature review relating to COVID-19, transmission and risk management in both the performance and music education space.

**1. Music Education and the impact of COVID-19 by Dr Ally Daubney and Duncan Mackrill from the University of Sussex.**

Dr Ally Daubney opened her presentation on the state of music education within the national curriculum pre-COVID-19 and the pressures faced by schools due to

**All-Party Parliamentary Group for Music Education, 14 July 2020  
Incorporated Society of Musicians**

government accountability measures and the EBacc. She explained that government policy has marginalised music in the school curriculum and referenced the APPG's *State of the Nation* report. She noted the decline of the curriculum music education workforce.

Dr Daubney stated that schools need clear guidance specifically for music education underpinned with evidence to facilitate the safe return of teaching music. Dr Daubney noted that the DCMS guidance was not intended for schools and Hubs.

Dr Daubney spoke to Ofqual's 2021 consultation, which closed on the 16 July. She explained that subjects such as music, drama and art will be scaled down while there will be no change to many other subjects. She also explained that some students may be forced to drop subjects next year to focus on their catch-up learning on "core-subjects" as part of the recovery curriculum.

Dr Daubney concluded that now is the time for a new National Plan for Music Education, which would ensure all young people can access sustained high-quality music education, augmented and supported through the network of Music Education Hubs. She called on the DfE to act swiftly and show strong leadership to ensure music education in schools can survive and thrive.

**2. Duncan Mackrill from the University of Sussex spoke next on the key issues for Music Education Hubs in England.**

Mr Mackrill began by stating that the core role of Hubs is to support schools, to provide opportunities and a clear progression route for all young people to access music education. He discussed how Hubs have responded differently to COVID-19, with some adapting more effectively to online working than others.

Mr Mackrill then spoke about the challenges around technology and the inequality of opportunity regarding access. He noted the lack of specific guidance to schools and Hubs and argued that an integrated approach was needed for Hubs and schools from the DfE outlining what is acceptable policies for online teaching and engagement.

Mr Mackrill discussed employment issues and explained that teachers have different contractual arrangements with Hubs. He noted that a de-professionalisation of visiting instrumental teachers was taking place in some Hubs through a move from contracted, engaged staff to casual contracts, or freelancing. He highlighted the considerable number of visiting instrumental teachers who were furloughed and his concern that many staff may not have a job to return to in September. He noted that the Government's self-employed support scheme runs out in August with no indication of further financial support to be offered.

Mr Mackrill outlined the operational challenges faced by Hubs, such as the lack of premises suitable for larger ensembles, additional cleaning costs for venues and spaces, and insurance for Hubs. Mr Mackrill then asked whether head teachers could give out their spaces to Hubs with these associated risks?

Mr Mackrill concluded by setting out five recommendations for how the challenges for Hubs might be addressed, which is dependent on clarity regarding the future of Hub funding. These include:

1. Sharing of digital practices between Hubs and schools;
2. Clear timely guidance on safeguarding from DfE;
3. ACE asking Hubs to account for how they have used their grant in this period;

**All-Party Parliamentary Group for Music Education, 14 July 2020  
Incorporated Society of Musicians**

4. Ending the de-professionalisation of visiting instrumental teachers taking place in some Hubs;
5. A revised National Plan for Music Education.

### **Questions from the attendees**

Deborah Annetts asked Dr Ally Daubney to further clarify her comments on Ofqual. Dr Daubney responded by stating that Ofqual are the regulator for examinations and the consultation states that core subjects are more important and non-negotiable, which is encouraging the dropping of "non-core" subjects within the recovery curriculum.

Deborah Annetts asked Dr Daubney what evidence there is to explain why some head teachers might not listen to Gavin Williamson on his call for a broad and balanced curriculum? Dr Daubney answered that she was hearing from teachers that music is being side-lined. She argued that the guidance and documentation being published is not reflective of what Gavin Williamson is saying.

Deborah Annetts asked Duncan Mackrill how music could be used within safeguarding by creating a friendly space for children to raise concerns, such as abuse experienced in the home during lockdown. Duncan Mackrill agreed that music is usually a safe space and students will feel free to express themselves, but this will be different in new online settings.

Jonathan Eno, CEO of Hot House Music stated that music education online has been more successful than anticipated. Mr Eno asked Duncan Mackrill about the evidence base and how it could be used to keep music education at the forefront but within a new digital frontier. He noted that more robust guidance for the music sector is needed from DfE. Duncan Mackrill agreed that a blended approach of online and face-to-face teaching is needed going forward.

Deborah Annetts explained that the ISM recently submitted evidence to the Education Select Committee Inquiry, which highlighted the importance of a blended approach. Ms Annetts stated that clarity on DfE communications would be helpful around issues such as safeguarding and teaching safely.

### **3. Sue Beckett- Chief Executive Officer of Portsmouth Music Service**

Sue Beckett outlined how Portsmouth Music Hub adapted and drove forward its offer for young people during previous months. She focused on the Hub's ability to deliver their four core roles relating to instrumental learning for all children, access to ensembles, clear and affordable progression routes and opportunities for every pupil to sing regularly and have access to choirs and other vocal ensembles.

Ms Beckett explained that the Hub's ability to deliver the core roles has been limited and challenging. She stated that the musical activity is a key part of the journey and recovery for young people, which is not possible without the Arts Council funding. She stated that Hubs cannot plan for the future without guarantees of future funding.

Ms Beckett discussed how music is an essential part of the solution as children return to schools in September, by building resilience, rebuilding communities and enabling young people to express and communicate emotions.

Ms Beckett spoke to the various ways Portsmouth Music Hub has continued its delivery, such as their campaign, *Music 4 All* which provided support and resources for schools for online music lessons. She noted the launch of *Song Source*, a digital song bank with over 200 original songs linked to the wider curriculum, which was free for anyone to access.

**All-Party Parliamentary Group for Music Education, 14 July 2020  
Incorporated Society of Musicians**

She also noted the launch of the initiative, *Sound Minds, Portsmouth*, which uses music and the arts to enable people to express themselves, and to enhance their well-being.

Ms Beckett concluded by outlining what is needed to help Hubs move forward; a focus on securing Arts Council funding for the future, clear and direct guidance so that schools can allow for curriculum, whole-class, instrumental and vocal teaching to take place safely including enabling ensemble music making for schools and music centres to recommence safely, as well as an increased means of supporting inclusion and enabling all young people to access music regardless of their circumstances.

#### **4. John Bergin – Chief Executive Officer of Newham Music Hub**

John Bergin spoke about how Newham Music Hub has stayed in contact with young people. He explained that when lockdown began, their aim was to continue music education provision by setting up online sessions, classes and music projects with teachers and industry professionals.

Mr Bergin stated that lockdown has provided insight into the future of learning. He spoke about the progress and opportunity of digital literacy, alongside the negative consequences of increased isolation and poor mental health.

He also spoke about how many families in Newham are living in digital poverty, which further isolated them, and highlighted the inequalities of digital education particularly for vulnerable and at-risk young people. He discussed Newham Music Hub's work with youth services, the community, and disabilities groups, to connect and reconnect with young people, through music.

Mr Bergin stated that funding needs to be in place now, so that music and the arts can continue to change lives, helping young people's emotional and mental wellbeing and bringing communities together.

#### **Questions and responses from the attendees**

Dr Martin Fautley, Professor of Education at Birmingham City University stated that music education in the classroom as a curricular entitlement is not the same as instrumental tuition, and there should be further clarity when discussing the two. He noted his desire to ensure the APPG for Music Education keeps its main focus on music education as a curricular entitlement for all children in schools.

Peter Bolton, Chief Executive of Kent Music spoke about the impact of his staff moving from hourly pay to salaries in response to Duncan Mackrill's comment about the de-casualisation of the workforce. Mr Bolton said this has brought benefits to the quality of teaching and the workforce. Sue Beckett shared her positive experience moving staff on to contracts. John Bergin commented that there needs to be a balance between hourly pay and contracts as some teachers may not want to move to contracts in order to maintain a portfolio career.

Elizabeth Stafford, Director of Music Education Solutions spoke about the difficulty for curriculum music to make their voices heard. She said over time all the music advocacy has centred around Hubs who are continuously looking for their next funding cycle. She argued that the only place you can get full inclusion in music education is within the curriculum because it is the only place where music is a statutory entitlement. Ms Stafford said we need to refocus the core offer of music curriculum in schools with Hubs supporting and expanding that offer.

**All-Party Parliamentary Group for Music Education, 14 July 2020  
Incorporated Society of Musicians**

John Bergin supported Ms Stafford's statement but said there should not be a separation between schools and Hubs as they are one of the same.

Deborah Annetts spoke to the complex nature of music education. She noted that it is essential to have strong classroom music education, which is where young people are, and this should not be marginalised. Ms Annetts stated the music education offer becomes destabilised if it is focused solely around the Music Education Hubs. Ms Annetts stated that the ISM and others need to do more advocacy work on bringing the music education curriculum to life so the DfE can visualise and understand what music education is.

Sue Beckett responded by stating that Hubs play an important role supporting music curriculum in the classroom.

### **5. Dr Jodie Underhill – global literature review update**

Dr Jodie Underhill briefly outlined the ISM's recently commissioned global literature review which studies the current research and information relating to COVID-19, transmission and risk management in both the performance and music education space.

She noted that the document is not intended to provide guidance but to highlight the information that is out there. Dr Underhill briefly covered some of the ways other countries were mitigating risks of COVID-19 transmission within education.

### **Conclusion by Deborah Annetts**

Deborah Annetts concluded that going forward the group needs to be clear on the core messages around the importance of classroom education. Ms Annetts urged those involved in classroom education to work with the ISM to get the message right on why classroom education matters so that it does not get marginalised as a result of COVID-19. Ms Annetts shared her concern that COVID-19 could push forward the agenda around core subjects, which does not promote a broad and balanced education for children.

Ms Annetts said that focus needs to remain on what is happening with regards to the new National Plan for Music Education and ISM will continue to ask relevant Parliamentary Questions.

Ms Annetts thanked Dr Underhill for her work on the ISM global literature review and noted that it shows there are solutions around music education and its teaching across the world. She said that the ISM would be sending the global literature review to all who had attended the APPG.

Ms Annetts thanked Diana Johnson MP for chairing the meeting. Diana Johnson concluded the meeting by thanking all attendees and noted that a future meeting will be held in the Autumn when Parliament returns.